

---

**FAITHFUL:  
THE CHURCH OF THE NAZARENE  
IN NORTH CHINA**

Floyd T. Cunningham

The Church of the Nazarene worked by comity arrangements in North China among Mandarin-speaking rural peasants in northwestern Shandong and southern Hebei Provinces. This was an area plagued by natural and human-made problems. Across the three decades of work in this area of China, the ministry of the church was well balanced. Without hesitancy the church conformed to the patterns and expectations of other missions in China. In addition to energetic village evangelism, the church undertook famine and flood relief projects, educated boys and even girls and old women as well as ministerial students, and established a hospital. These enterprises flowed as much out of compassion as out of evangelistic concerns, though the missionaries rarely, if ever, separated the two. The spiritual needs were acute, as the missionaries perceived them. Education and medicine as much as the Bible could dispel the superstitious customs and ancient traditions that, as the missionaries saw it, kept the people in spiritual bondage.

Outside events affected the missionaries both in spirit and in behavior. Social and political changes swirling around the mission field made an impact on missionaries' actions. In very concrete ways the attempt of the mission to meet immediate needs often outweighed other considerations of philosophy and policy.

In some respects the mission lagged behind other fields such as Japan and even India in the development of a district. In spite of the fact that Chinese leaders had been pressing missionaries for several years to allow them a louder voice in the affairs of the church, there were only

three ordained Chinese ministers when the missionaries left North China, and all three fled to the south during or after the war. Actually having no Chinese district organization may have benefitted the church in some ways as a loose but effective band of Chinese lay pastors and itinerants pressed the work forward for decades without contact with or support from the general church. Future events seemed to bear true what one Chinese told a departing missionary in 1940: “You do not need to be ashamed to go back to America; you have lots of ‘face’ as you return home. . . . You can say that you left behind you in China a self-governing, self-supporting church.”<sup>5</sup> Because the church in North China was markedly evangelistic, it was able both to maintain itself and convert thousands to the Christian faith.

There was a fleeting contact with the field in 1947, but by then Mao Zedong’s Seventh Army was in control of the area. So the Nazarene Church turned its attention to the South, where both missionaries and national leaders concerted an effort in Jiangxi Province for about 20 months, 1947 to 1949. Then that area also fell to the Communist government. In the middle of the 1950s Nazarenes officially entered Taiwan, and in the 1970s Hong Kong, but in neither of these locations was there much connection with the original work in North China.

### **Before the Nazarene Work**

Being at the crossroads of Shandong, Hebei, Henan and Shanxi provinces, political and criminal activity surrounded the area assumed by the Nazarenes. Natural disasters related to the Yellow River’s frequent flooding combined with antagonism toward both the imperial rule in Beijing and foreign intervention in Chinese affairs to produce political and social rebels in the area by the late nineteenth century. The imposition of textile manufacturing by foreign concerns misdirected labor and further worsened the economic situation. So young men turned against order and law. These young men included the Boxers,

---

<sup>5</sup>John W. Pattee, “Effect of the War on the Churches of Chengan County,” *Other Sheep* (October 1942): 12; and Pattee, *Hazardous Days in China* (Pasadena, CA: the author, n.d.), 103.

who arose in this region, and others who engaged in banditry. Those seeking to escape from the law could easily do so by crossing provincial borders.<sup>6</sup>

Roman Catholic mission activity in the area that became Nazarene preceded the Protestant work. The Catholic mission was represented by mostly German and Belgian friars of the Society of the Divine Word and Jesuits who had been active around Daming as early as the seventeenth century. They protected converts, some of whom were suspected criminals, from local officials. In eastern Shandong in the late 1890s the friars called in the German militia to protect them, their property and churches, and their converts. Protestant missionaries, who began to arrive in eastern Shandong Province in the mid-1860s, likewise advocated foreign intervention to protect their interests. Some local Chinese embraced Christianity in the desire both to reap financial rewards and to escape from government authorities. The missionaries faced hostile political forces. The Chinese gentry resented intrusion upon their established Confucian-based order. The alliance between the imperial state and foreign powers in the late-nineteenth century caused discontent on local levels with Christian churches. The reputation of Christianity in the region was abysmal at the end of the century.<sup>7</sup>

The inevitable outbreak against foreign control came in 1900 following a great drought. The Boxers believed themselves to be possessed by spirits. They attacked both Roman Catholics and Protestants. Shandong and Hebei Provinces were centers of violence against missionaries. Many missionaries welcomed not only foreign intervention to end the rebellion, but also the humiliating concessions from the Chinese that followed. The establishment of a Republic under Sun Yat-

---

<sup>6</sup>Joseph E. Esherick, *The Origins of the Boxer Uprising* (Berkeley: U. of California Press, 1987), 68-95.

<sup>7</sup>Esherick, *Boxer Uprising*, 88. On Roman Catholic work see Edward J. Malatesta, "China and the Society of Jesus: An Historical-theological Essay," paper presented at the Symposium on the History of Christianity in China, Hong Kong, October 2-4, 1996, pp. 40-43 (cited with the permission of the author).

sen reinforced confidence among missionaries. After decades of working for the end of opium addiction in China, by 1911 missionaries began to see local Chinese officials enforce an end to opium trade with India and reduce local production. Until the next wave of anti-foreignism in 1927, calmness toward Christianity dominated Chinese society.<sup>8</sup>

Into this now relatively stable political and religious climate, Horace Houlding, his wife, and a group of young missionaries established the "South Chili Gospel Mission" in southern Hebei Province. The Houldings had first arrived in Tianjin in 1896, and had worked unconnected with any society. Fleeing to the United States after the Boxer Rebellion, the Houldings found that news of the Rebellion and its martyrs had peaked interest among American Christians toward China missions. The Houldings had little problem recruiting a group of young missionaries, whom they took with them when they returned to China in late 1901. After language study in Tianjin, the band established a headquarters near Daming. They were among the first missionaries to enter the area after the Boxer Rebellion. The missionaries claimed that though there were Moslems in Daming, who in fact warmly greeted

---

<sup>8</sup>See John L. Nevius, *Demon Possession and Allied Things*, 3rd ed. (New York: Fleming H. Revell, n.d. [1st ed., 1894]), 17-40; Isaac Ketler, *The Tragedy of Paotingfu*, 2nd ed. (New York: Fleming H. Revell, 1902); Geraldine Taylor, *Pastor Hsi (of North China): One of China's Christians* (London: Morgan Scott, 1903), xiii-xiv; Paul A. Varg, *Missionaries, Chinese, and Diplomats: The American Protestant Missionary Movement in China, 1890-1950* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton U. Press, 1958), 31-50, 86-87; Stuart C. Miller, "Ends and Means: Missionary Justification for Force in Nineteenth Century China," in *The Missionary Enterprise in China and America*, ed. John K. Fairbank (Cambridge, MA: Harvard U. Press, 1974), 273-282; Kuang-sheng Liao, *Anti-Foreignism and Modernization in China: 1860-1980*, 2nd ed. (Hong Kong: Chinese U. Press, 1986), 39-52; Murray Rubinstein, "Witness to the Chinese Millennium: Southern Baptist Perceptions of the Chinese Revolution, 1911-1921," in *United States Attitudes and Policies Toward China: The Impact of American Missionaries*, ed. Patricia Neils (Armonk, NY: M. E. Sharpe, 1990), 154, 166-167; Kathleen L. Lodwick, *Crusaders Against Opium: Protestant Missionaries in China, 1874-1917* (Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 1996), 166-167, 171-172, 182-185; and Paul A. Cohen, *History in Three Keys: The Boxers as Event, Experience, and Myth* (New York: Columbia U. Press, 1997), especially 96-118, "Mass Spirit Possession."

them, there were only two known Chinese Christians in the city. French Jesuits entered Daming in the same year. The Gospel Mission band eventually numbered as many as 76 persons living in nine cities within a radius of 60 miles from Daming. Their work included three “higher” primary schools.<sup>9</sup>

Among the first missionaries in the Houlding group were some with holiness movement affiliations. For instance, Jacob Kohl and Mary A. Hill were members of Phineas Bresee’s Church of the Nazarene in Los Angeles. Houlding stationed Kohl, who arrived in China in 1903, in a crude house two miles from Daming, where he labored, with only one three-month furlough, until his death in Shanghai at age 52 in 1919.<sup>10</sup> Hill, who had served for a year as principal of the Nazarene school in Los Angeles, eventually served in China for over 30 years under the National Holiness Association (later renamed the World Gospel Mission). Other early arrivals affiliated with the Houlding mission included Catherine Flagler and Leon and Emma Osborn, all of whom eventually joined the Nazarene mission.<sup>11</sup>

---

<sup>9</sup>Thomas Cochrane, *Survey of the Missionary Occupation of China* (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society for China, 1913), 312; Kenneth S. Latourette, *A History of Christian Missions in China* (New York: Macmillan, 1929), 402; Mrs. Cecil Troxel and Mrs. John J. Trachsel, *Cecil Troxel: The Man and the Work* (Chicago: National Holiness Missionary Society, 1948), 23-52. See Malatesta, “China and the Society of Jesus,” 40.

<sup>10</sup>*China Mission Year Book*, eds. E. C. Lobenstine and A. L. Warnshuis (Shanghai: Kwang Hsueh, 1920), 339; L.C. Osborn, *Hitherto! 1914-1939* (Tientsin: Peiyang Press, [1939]), 1-2; Osborn, *The China Story: The Church of the Nazarene in North China, South China, and Taiwan* (KC: NPH, 1969), 9-14.

<sup>11</sup>Osborn to Reynolds, September 14, 1918; W. W. Cary, *Story of the National Holiness Missionary Society* (Chicago: National Holiness Missionary Society, 1940), 7-12, 77, 135; E. A. Girvin, *Phineas F. Bresee: A Prince in Israel; A Biography* (KC: NPH, 1916), 237; “In Memoriam: Catherine Flagler, 1874-1956,” *Other Sheep* (January 1957), inside front cover; Timothy L. Smith, *Called Unto Holiness: The Story of the Nazarene: The Formative Years* (KC: NPH, 1962), 138, 250-251; Ronald Kirkemo, *For Zion’s Sake: A History of Pasadena/Point Loma College* (San Diego: Point

A rift occurred in the South Chili Gospel Mission in 1909. Though the work bustled with activity, many of the young missionaries failed to adjust to either the culture of China or the captain of the mission. Houlding did not teach holiness as clearly or as strongly as some of those whom he recruited. Furthermore, policy disagreements developed over both the “Americanization” that some missionaries saw being forced upon Chinese converts and undemocratic procedures within the mission itself. In January 1909 two strong young leaders, Cecil Troxel, the treasurer and deputy director of the mission, and Woodford Taylor withdrew from the Houlding work. The two men quickly traveled to Lintsing and met with the American Congregationalist Mission there. They apparently attended a conference that was being held regarding comity arrangements in the area. The conference included representatives from the London Missionary Society, and the Northern Presbyterian and Methodist Episcopal Missions. Houlding’s South Chili Gospel Mission was accounted for only by letter, which, perhaps, Troxel and Taylor bore themselves. As a result, the American Board ceded ten counties from its own field to Troxel and Taylor, who must have given the conference representatives some assurance that they would find a sponsoring agency. Apparently these counties transferred from the American Board included at least some of the area in which Houlding’s work was already established.<sup>12</sup>

Troxel, Taylor, and their families returned to America in 1909 and undertook fund raising within the holiness movement for the China work. With this prodding, the National Holiness Association, successor to the National Campmeeting Association for the Promotion of Holiness, formed its own Missionary Society in 1910, with C. J. Fowler, a Methodist, who was also President of the National Holiness Associa-

---

Loma, 1992), 8.

<sup>12</sup>*China Mission Year Book*, 4th issue, ed. D. MacGillvray (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society for China, 1913), 279; Ida Vieg, “A Brief History of the Nazarene Mission in China,” April 20, 1921 (file 262-56); Troxel and Trachsel, *Troxel*, 52, 88-91; Cary, *Story*, 7-8. Compare R. Pierce Beaver, *Ecumenical Beginnings in Protestant World Mission: A History of Comity* (New York: Thomas Nelson, 1962), 119.

tion, as Missionary Society President. With this backing, the missionary couples returned to China. They established a headquarters at Nankwantao, about 25 miles northeast of Daming, and recruited two Chinese workers, Hang Hung-yu and Chang Hung-en. The 1911 Republican Revolution forced the missionaries to evacuate briefly to Tianjin, but otherwise the work grew rapidly.<sup>13</sup>

Troxel and Taylor had well established the National Holiness Association mission when talks began concerning the possible incorporation of it with the Church of the Nazarene. The Nazarene church included many who felt deep kinship with all holiness people, no matter their affiliation. Some dreamed of a united holiness denomination encompassing all the dynamics of the movement. C. W. Ruth was both a keen booster of the young denomination and one who retained close ties to the holiness movement as a whole, being among the best-loved evangelists of the National Holiness Association and serving on its Missionary Society Committee. As such it was natural for him to try to bring the N.H.A. work in China together with the Church of the Nazarene. The N.H.A. board, in fact, advised the missionaries in China to seek affiliation with a denomination, since the N.H.A. had no intention of becoming one. The board approved of the Church of the Nazarene's taking over the work if matters could be arranged satisfactorily. By 1913 there were nine American missionaries working under the N.H.A., along with ten Chinese preachers and ten Bible women. Bible women visited homes around the field, shared the gospel, exhorted and did a variety of other tasks. A small school operated for training pastors. Ruth advised patience so that a transition could be amicably effected in order to bring the work under the Church of the Nazarene.<sup>14</sup>

---

<sup>13</sup>Troxel and Trachsel, *Troxel*, 93-113; Cary, *Story*, 9-10, 15.

<sup>14</sup>*Holiness Unto the Lord* (N.p., [1913]), 16 pp. (file 451-45); H.F. Reynolds, "Around the World Trip," to the General Missionary Board of the Pentecostal Church of the Nazarene, n.d. (file 262-19); C.W. Ruth to Reynolds, November 8, 1913, in [H.F. Reynolds], "China," n.d. (File 453-3); Cary, *Story*, 293-294.

Meanwhile, General Superintendent and Foreign Missions Secretary H. F. Reynolds saw an opportunity for the denomination in a young couple, Peter and Anna Kiehn, both of whom were former missionaries to China. Peter Kiehn had been raised Mennonite, and was a member of a holiness congregation in Hutchinson, Kansas (which became Nazarene in 1908). Kiehn had attended the holiness Bible school there before sailing to China in 1906 at the age of 21. He worked in the Shanhsian district in Shandong Province under the Light and Hope Mission of the Mennonite Missionary Society, which had begun work in 1905. The Mennonite Mission included one lower and three higher primary schools, two middle schools, an orphanage and industrial work.

Henry C. Bartel, the organizer of the Mennonite work, was a friend of Kiehn's family and an uncle of Anna Schmidt. Like Peter Kiehn, Anna Schmidt had been raised a Mennonite. She arrived in China in 1906 and also worked in Shandong province. She and Peter Kiehn were married in China in 1908. For a time they helped to establish a station in Tsaouchoufu, working there in cooperation with the South Chili Gospel Mission. They furloughed in 1912, and then officially united with the Church of the Nazarene while attending the Nazarene college in Bethany, Oklahoma. Kiehn was ordained by Reynolds in 1913.<sup>15</sup>

Reynolds learned through Ruth that though there was a good possibility of the N.H.A. work affiliating with the Nazarenes, in no way would their missionaries accept Kiehn as leader. They knew him from his previous term. Ruth warned that a premature departure for China by Kiehn might cause the negotiations between the Church of the Nazarene and the N.H.A. to fail. He thought that Kiehn should wait until matters were decided. Nevertheless, Reynolds took Kiehn and his wife, along with Glennie Sims on his worldwide trip as the officially appointed

---

<sup>15</sup>Cochrane, *Survey of the Missionary Occupation*, 289; Latourette, *Christian Missions in China*, 600; Amy N. Hinshaw, *Messengers of the Cross in China* (KC: Woman's Foreign Missionary Society, n.d.), 7-13; R.R. Hodges in *Herald of Holiness* (October 15, 1930), typescript (file 759-1); Osborn, *China*, 15; Kiehn, "The Legacy of Peter and Anna Kiehn," received January 15, 1970, Nazarene Archives, 10, 23, 29-30, 39-40, 48-50, 52.



Nazarene workers to China. They arrived in Shanghai in January 1914. They made their way to the N.H.A. headquarters in Nankwantao. The N.H.A. work impressed Reynolds. Amiable and frank talks ensued between Reynolds and the N.H.A. missionaries.<sup>12</sup>

In a letter that soon followed to the General Missionary Board of the Church of the Nazarene, the N.H.A. missionaries expressed their desire to give their converts the privileges of a church home. They understood that the National Holiness Association refused to take denominational form even in its mission work, and found it acceptable for the N.H.A. mission in China to be taken over by the Nazarene church, and governed according to its *Manual*. They presented themselves as candidates for missionary appointment. Their only stipulation was that the Nazarenes assume full financial responsibility by November 1916.<sup>13</sup>

At the time Reynolds recognized it as a “splendid opportunity,” though a great financial undertaking. He considered Woodford Taylor a good superintendent (“until such time as the work had developed into a District and had its assembly, when it would elect its own Superintendent”).<sup>14</sup>

While waiting for the matter to be fully decided, the N.H.A. gave about one half of the area assigned to it by comity to the Church of the Nazarene. This partition would become unnecessary if and when union took place. The Kiehns took a station in the area apportioned to the Nazarenes, at Chaocheng, on the northern side of the Yellow River in Shandong province. Reynolds visited the place, and he as well as the N.H.A. workers felt that the area held strong possibilities. N.H.A. missionaries regularly itinerated there and had recently begun Sunday

---

<sup>12</sup>[Reynolds], “China,” 1-4; Reynolds, “Around the World Trip”; Reynolds, *World-Wide Missions* (KC: NPH, 1915), 66-67, 88-97.

<sup>13</sup>National Holiness Association, China, to General Missionary Board, Pentecostal Church of the Nazarene, February 11, 1914 (file 453-3).

<sup>14</sup>[Reynolds], “China,” 4.

worship services in the city. The first ones to attend were Moslems. While the N.H.A. missionaries waited for the Nazarenes to decide on the merger, they assigned Kiehn a Chinese evangelist, Li Ching-ho, as his co-worker.<sup>15</sup>

Before going on his way to India (to meet a host of crises in Calcutta), Reynolds, Peter and Anna Kiehn and Glennie Sims established the first policy statement for the Nazarene work in China. The policy followed closely a similar one drawn for Japan a few weeks earlier, but sanctioned more institutional work in the case of China. The primary impetus remained evangelism, which was to be accomplished through touring from village to village, visiting house-to-house, opening new stations and preaching at fairs and markets. Then the church would nurture converts in local congregations. In addition, the group in China saw the necessity of medical work, literature work (translating holiness books), colportage, schools, and even industrial training so that students could support themselves. The policy stated that the missionaries must encourage Chinese Christians to tithe. The policy was more explicit than the one in Japan in stating that when a local church achieved one-half self-support in paying the pastor's salary and property rental, it would be entitled to elect its own board members. When a local church became fully self-supporting, missionary control over it was to be relinquished, except as provided for in the *Manual*. That Reynolds and the church in general had not thought through the ultimate goals of church government was clear in one statement Reynolds made: that the Chinese would eventually have their own General as well as District Superintendents, along with evangelists and college presidents.<sup>16</sup>

---

<sup>15</sup>[Reynolds], "China," 4; *Holiness Unto the Lord*, 11; "Third Annual Report of the National Holiness Mission in China," April 1, 1914, 5; Reynolds, *World-Wide*, 94; Glennie Sims to Fifth General Assembly, Kansas City [1919] (file 214-45); Cary, *Story*, 126-129; Kiehn, "Legacy," 52. For later World Gospel Mission work see also Laura Trachsel, *Kindled Fires in Asia* (N.p., 1960).

<sup>16</sup>[Fragment of] "China Policy" (file 305-15); Reynolds, "China," 7; "The Policy of the General Missionary Board of the Pentecostal Church of the Nazarene to Govern the Work in China," n.d. [1919?] (file 305-14).

Reynolds returned to America optimistic that union with the N.H.A. work would be effected. He was hopeful that its present supporters would not cease financial contributions should the work become denominational, and he was prayerful that the Nazarenes would be able to fully support it by 1916.

But it was not to be. The Pentecostal Mission headquartered in Nashville, Tennessee, united with the Church of the Nazarene. The Pentecostal Mission had extensive missionary work and heavy financial obligations around the world. The Great War also created many uncertainties. Accessioning the N.H.A. work and workers seemed too great an undertaking for the young denomination at the time. Nevertheless, some Nazarenes independently continued to support the N.H. A. work in China.<sup>17</sup>

### **Evangelistic and Institutional Work**

Peter Kiehn built the church in Chaocheng upon the contacts of the N.H.A. work and extended evangelistic activities to the north. By 1915 nine Chinese workers were in the employment of the church, including three Bible women, Li Ching-ho, the evangelist, and Chang Huah-sin, who had assisted Kiehn during his earlier term in China. The paid workers lived at the mission station established in Chaocheng and itinerated from this base. The first Nazarene church to be organized in China, in May 1915, was thus at Chaocheng. Twelve Chinese, including some but not all of the workers, joined. Kiehn bound himself closely to the Chinese workers. In the absence of other missionaries, he found that “no place is left for lonesomeness, but Jesus and the Chinese have taken the place of home and loved ones.”<sup>18</sup>

---

<sup>17</sup>Reynolds, “China,” 11-13; Reynolds to A.J. Smith, March 5, 1927. See also John T. Benson, *Holiness Organized or Unorganized? A History 1898-1915 of the Pentecostal Mission* (Nashville: Trevecca, 1977), 181-182. Compare Smith, *Called*, 197-199.

<sup>18</sup>Kiehn, “Annual Station Report: Chaocheng,” August 12, 1916.

By this time missionaries had decided that the Nazarene church in China would be called the Hsuan Sheng Hui, meaning, loosely, “The Preaching [or Proclaiming] Holiness Church.” This was the same name as the N.H.A. This was by intention so that the Chinese would catch the fact that the Church of the Nazarene and the N.H.A. were alike. Across the years missionaries and Chinese workers from one side preached for the other. Following along the lines that Reynolds had initiated, the Nazarenes in China abided by comity arrangement. They worked harmoniously—particularly with Free Methodists, headquartered in Kaifeng, 125 miles south of the Nazarene field. Nazarenes used Sunday School literature published inter-denominationally by the China Sunday School Association.<sup>19</sup>

The missionaries continued to gather Chinese workers for the various ministries they initiated, which included primary schools for both boys and girls. Sims in particular worked among children, and persuaded some families to unbind their daughters’ feet. The missionaries paid teachers and other workers from contributions from laypersons, and from Sunday School classes and churches in America, rather than through the church’s general budget for China. This forged close bonds among American contributors for the work in China.<sup>20</sup>

By the time of the first so-called district assembly, held June 4, 1917, there were four missionaries (Ida Vieg had transferred from the N.H.A. to the Nazarene work), and nine Chinese workers ranging in age from their 20’s to their 40’s. Among them, Chang Hua-huw, Jen Chin-ya, Chang Hsi-tien and Chang Chien-hsun toured and preached at fairs

---

<sup>19</sup>Kiehn, “Chang Hua-hsin,” *Other Sheep* (August 1914), 2; Kiehn, “Annual Report, May 24, 1915, “First District Assembly,” June 4, 1917; Glennie Sims, “An Interesting Letter from China,” *Other Sheep* (July 1915), 3; *Other Sheep* (November 1917), 6; Anna Kiehn, “Death of Chang Hua-hsin,” *Other Sheep* (February 1918), 2, 5; Roy E. Swim, *A History of Nazarene Missions* (KC: NPH, n.d.), 92-94; Pattee, *Hazardous Days*, 57-58; Osborn to Samuel Young, November 30, 1964; Kiehn, “Legacy,” 54.

<sup>20</sup>Sims, “China’s Open Door Your Opportunity,” *Other Sheep* (January 1915), 3-4.

and tent meetings, and Li Ching-i pastored an outstation at Puchow. Kiehn prepared a Chinese course of study for educating the workers and used winters for conducting daily Bible studies with them. He sent a few to the N.H.A. training school. Other workers joined, including several Bible women past 60 years old. Among the emerging leaders, Chang Chien-hsun had been converted at Chaocheng after earlier contacts with the National Holiness work. Eventually Chang served as preacher in Chaocheng, Fanhsien, Puchow, and other locations. Li Ching-i was converted from Confucianism in 1914 at the N.H.A. station at Nankwantao under the preaching of Chang Hua-hsin. Kiehn later visited his village and persuaded him to attend the daily Bible studies for workers, and then sent him out. National workers such as Chang and Li pioneered outstations, which the missionaries visited from time to time.<sup>21</sup>

The converts were mostly poor farmers. Often they came into the church as families. In choosing to become Christians, they cut themselves off from other family clans. Christians formed their own social groups within villages.<sup>22</sup>

When new missionaries joined the mission in the late 1910s, including Otis and Zella Deale and Leon and Emma Osborn, the missionaries decided to enter Daming, and to make it the center of the Nazarene mission. They apparently decided this with the permission of Houlding, who still had the base of his mission just outside the city walls. Both the Mennonites and the Jesuits were active as well in Daming. Nonetheless, the Nazarene missionaries planned for Daming to be the site of a Bible school, a hospital, and missionary residences.

---

<sup>21</sup>Kiehn, "Annual Station Report: Chaocheng," August 12, 1916; "First District Assembly"; "Annual Station Report: Chaocheng," 1917; "Annual Station Report: Chaocheng," 1919; "Li Ching-i's Testimony," *Other Sheep* (June 1918), 5; [Reynolds, comp.], *History of the Foreign Work of the Church of the Nazarene* (KC: General Board of Foreign Missions, 1921), 25; Amy N. Hinshaw, *Native Torch Bearers* (KC: NPH, 1934), 50-51.

<sup>22</sup>Hinshaw, *Native Torch Bearers*, 42-60; Martin C. Yang, *A Chinese Village: Taitou, Shantung Province* (New York: Columbia U. Press, 1945), 211, 241.

The Osborns, former Methodists who had served in China under the Houlding mission before being commissioned as Nazarene missionaries, took the Kiehns' place at Chaocheng, and the Kiehns moved to Daming.<sup>23</sup>

During the 1920s the Chinese church grew stronger as a result of the expectations placed upon it by missionaries. A requirement for membership in the church was the ability to read one of the New Testament Gospels. As this was imposed upon women as well as men, it necessitated that more education be given to women than normally available in Chinese society—especially its rural areas. The requirements of literacy indicated the desire of the church that members know what they believed. Prospective members were also made to answer a list of questions of a doctrinal and ethical nature, a kind of catechism. This, missionaries hoped, guarded against individuals affiliating with the mission for any but spiritual reasons.<sup>24</sup>

As for organization, each evangelist and worker reported to the district assembly, which they also divided into committees in order to discuss various facets of the work. By 1922, when Reynolds returned to China and presided over a district assembly composed only of missionaries, there were three established local churches, including those in Daming and Chengan as well as Chaocheng, and 207 members. No Chinese workers were ready yet for ordination. Stella Reynolds, who accompanied her husband on this trip, initiated the first missions auxiliary among the Chinese women. The church employed 70 Chinese workers by the beginning of 1923. In spite of the strict scrutiny of members, the church grew to 625 members by 1925. Two hundred ninety two of these were members of the Daming church. There were about 1,500 “probationary” members awaiting baptism. The Chinese

---

<sup>23</sup>*China Mission Year Book*, 6th issue, ed. D. MacGillvray (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society for China, 1915), 82, 84; Swim, *History*, 95-96; Osborn, *China*, 19-21; Kiehn, “Legacy,” 68.

<sup>24</sup>“Proceedings of the Fifth Annual Assembly,” November 1921; “Annual Station Report: Daming,” 1923.

also contributed to the district's expenses, giving over \$1,200.00 in 1925.<sup>25</sup>

Part of the reason for the growth of the denomination in these years was the social concern evidenced by the church and its missionaries. To missionaries, it seemed a natural and inevitable part of the mission of the church, especially as educational, medical, and industrial work also had been part of the Houlding and Mennonite missions out of which several of the missionaries came. From the beginning, the Kiehns and Sims dispensed medicine. The mission extended direct help to poor women at Daming. At Chaocheng the missionaries distributed used clothing to the poor. As in India, across the years, Nazarenes maintained primary schools in rural towns. By 1924, for instance, the Morning Light School for boys in Chengan had 110 students.<sup>26</sup>

During the severe 1920-1921 famine, Nazarenes in North America raised \$25,000.00 for "China Famine Relief." In order to distribute this amount, the missionaries employed Chinese workers to construct a large brick church, missionary residences, and a wall around the compound at Daming. At the same time, Kiehn was responsible for Red Cross funds, which he used to pay workers to construct a 45-mile road from Daming to Handan, where there was a railroad station. While the men worked on the road, their wives were enrolled in Bible and literacy classes. Meanwhile, parents desperate for food sent their children to Nazarene primary schools, where they not only were fed, but received a stipend to help their families. French Jesuits in Daming were doing the same at their schools. At Chaocheng, Osborn used money from the International Famine Relief Commission to initiate a straw-braiding industry.

---

<sup>25</sup>"Proceedings of the Sixth Annual Assembly," December 1922-January 1923; "Proceedings of the Third Annual Council, China District," October 1924; "Proceedings of the Fourth Annual Council, China District," September 1925; Swim, *History*, 98-99.

<sup>26</sup>Sims, "China's Open Door," 3-4; "China," *Other Sheep* (March 1916), 5; "Proceedings of the Fourth Annual Council"; *The China Nazarene* (March 1924), 8 (file 628-8).

Workers also constructed a large Nazarene church in Chaocheng at this time. And at Puchow, missionary Otis Deale distributed corn and black grain bread. Then, in 1922 the Yellow River once more overflowed. In this case the International Famine Relief asked missionary Harry Wiese to distribute 30,000 bags of grain and to oversee a crew of 10,000 workers in the rebuilding of a dam near the Nazarene mission station at Puhsein. Osborn supervised another crew of 5,000 in the southeastern part of the field.<sup>27</sup>

On the part of the missionaries, medical and social ministries demonstrated the perfect love that holiness of heart was supposed to create, and fulfilled the church's responsibilities and duties to the poor. Nazarene missionaries such as Kiehn and Wiese took for granted that these were appropriate for a holiness mission. They also liked the idea that these projects were not mere handouts, but required something from the Chinese themselves. Neither the American value of self-reliance nor the missiological goal of self-support was put aside. Nazarene missionaries in China never thought of these deeds in terms of the "social gospel," which, like other evangelicals in the 1920s, Nazarenes associated with modernism.<sup>28</sup>

From the Chinese perspective, these same ministries provided incentives and inducements for them to become Christians. The Chinese could be pragmatic when it came to looking for benefits that would improve their material as well as spiritual lives. Christianity offered affiliation with a prosperous people. They saw the large houses Nazarene missionaries built on the compound in Daming for their boisterous families. Possibly not all of the Chinese converts saw

---

<sup>27</sup>"Proceedings of the Fifth Annual Council, China District, September 1926"; Swim, *History*, 96-98; Osborn, *China*, 29-34. Rarely did the Nazarene missionaries reflect on broader political currents in China. On Jesuit relief activities in Daming see Malatesta, "China and the Society of Jesus," 41-42.

<sup>28</sup>For similar views toward medical and other social ministries see Wayne Flynt and Gerald W. Berkley, *Taking Christianity to China: Alabama Missionaries to the Middle Kingdom, 1850-1950* (Tuscaloosa: U. of Alabama Press, 1997), 169-170, 180.



immediately the necessity of jettisoning household gods and other spiritual influences from their lives—but Nazarenes insisted that these must go if they were to be Christian.<sup>29</sup>

Ida Vieg developed an interest in the education and conversion of elderly women. Raised among Swedish Lutherans in Iowa, Vieg had studied at Augustana Business College. She was converted in a Methodist church while teaching in Washington state. While working in an urban mission in Portland, Oregon, she attended a holiness camp meeting. She became a Nazarene shortly before going to China in 1911. She transferred from the N.H.A. to the Nazarene mission in 1916. Her assignment was to keep the mission's financial records. Once settled in Chaocheng, where she was stationed at first, she became burdened for the elderly women. No one seemed to be caring for them. In the protocol of society, such care would have to come from another woman. The Chinese did not like the idea of men and women studying together. Vieg began to teach the old women to read the Bible. Mr. Yu, who was business manager at the Bresee Hospital in Daming, remarked regarding her work: "For sixty or even seventy years their brains had hardly ever been used. . . . But Miss Vieg did not seem to mind it. She had love and patience in helping old women."

As with previous generations of women missionaries in China, Vieg's approach was intensely personal. After working with old women in Chaocheng for four years, and a furlough (1920-21), Vieg expanded her ministry to women throughout the Nazarene field. The next six years were productive and endeared her to the Chinese church. She furloughed again in 1927, but this time headquarters was unable for financial reasons to send her back to China. So she involved herself in a rescue mission in Oakland, California. The old Chinese women kept asking the missionaries on the field when Vieg would return. Being informed, eventually, that the reasons were financial, the Chinese women through their own Women's Foreign Missionary Society took up

---

<sup>29</sup>Hinshaw, *Native Torch Bearers*, 57. On conversion see Alan Hunter and Kim-Kwong Chan, *Protestantism in Contemporary China* (Cambridge: Cambridge U. Press, 1993), 163-168.

a collection for her among the Chinese churches and outstations. The missionaries then forwarded the money to Kansas City.

Finally, in 1932, Vieg returned and continued her work among the old women. Then in 1934 she developed cancer. She refused to return home for treatment, and seemed to recover. The cancer recurred in 1936, but again she decided to stay in China. She died in Daming in 1937 at age 55, and was buried on the compound. Mr. Yu eulogized about her: “She comes to this land, a foreign land to her, and adopts these old women as hers; she does not consider them too dirty or uncouth to associate with. . . . She has at times even slept with them . . . . Just to think of such love for our people, ready to die out here away from relatives and native land, she certainly considered us her people.” Her grave-site became a favorite prayer spot for Bible school students. Even at night, awakened missionaries could hear students praying at her tomb.<sup>30</sup>

Like other Christian groups, the Church of the Nazarene gave Chinese women opportunities beyond what was available to them in society—especially the rural peasant society in which the Church of the Nazarene worked. Through the church, some women achieved leadership roles that otherwise would have been impossible. In Chaocheng, Mrs. Chao enrolled in Bible study classes for women, became a leading Bible woman, and then discovered a gift for healing the sick and casting out demons. Another woman in Chaocheng, Mrs. Ma, was determined to send her younger daughter to school. Though the family was not yet Christian, the daughter enrolled in the Nazarene school and became “an active little missionary” in her home, urging her grandparents and parents to discard their idols. The young girl even threw away the idols herself, to her grandfather’s ire. She won her mother and grandmother, and eventually even her grandfather became a Christian. The mother, in turn, became an “ardent evangelist” and successful Bible woman, itinerating from village to village, telling

---

<sup>30</sup>Edith P. Goodnow, *Hazarded Lives* (KC: NPH, 1942), 127-147. See also Hinshaw, *Messengers of the Cross in China*, 23-27; *Other Sheep* (June 1937), 2-3; Anne Sutherland, “Under the Locust Trees,” *Other Sheep* (August 1937), 24-25.

thousands of women and children of Christ. Another Chaocheng worker, Mrs. Kao, bore 13 children (five of whom lived to maturity) before her husband died and she was reduced to begging. She became a Christian, and soon thereafter a Bible woman. She served as the Wieses' language assistant during their early days and became close personally to Katherine Wiese. Kao was called to preach and was stationed in a variety of localities. Another woman, Hsu Kwei-pin's wife, was educated in a Christian home for girls in the South Chili Mission and, confessed her husband, was "a truer, hotter-hearted Christian than I am."<sup>31</sup> She taught in the school for girls at Daming.<sup>32</sup>

Not only did the mission refuse to enroll girls in their primary schools if their feet were bound, but in the Bible school women were educated alongside men (even if they had to enter their classrooms by separate doors). They served as Bible women, which meant not only teaching and praying with other women, but preaching and evangelizing entire families. If their spouses were pastors, the Bible women worked alongside them as partners in ministry, and often spearheaded local missionary societies.

The example of strong women among the missionaries, both those married and those single, such as Vieg, provided an alternative model of being a woman in Chinese society. Unlike other missions, a Nazarene

---

<sup>31</sup>Hinshaw, *Native Torch Bearers*, 52.

<sup>32</sup>Hinshaw, *Native Torch Bearers*, 42-60. Compare Yang, *A Chinese Village*, 188-189; Jane Hunter, *The Gospel of Gentility: American Women Missionaries in Turn-of-the-Century China* (New Haven: Yale U. Press, 1984), xiv, 15-22; Marjorie King, "Exporting Femininity, Not Feminism: Nineteenth-Century U.S. Missionary Women's Efforts to Emancipate Chinese Women," in *Women's Work for Women: Missionaries and Social Change in Asia*, ed. Leslie A. Flemming (Boulder, CO: Westview, 1989), 117-135; Kwok Pui-lan, *Chinese Women and Christianity, 1860-1927* (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1991), 70-86; Kwok Pui-lan, "Chinese Women and Protestant Christianity at the Turn of the Twentieth Century," in *Christianity in China from the Eighteenth Century to the Present*, ed. Daniel H. Bays (Stanford: Stanford U. Press, 1996), 200-203; and Flynt and Berkley, *Taking Christianity to China*, chapter 9, "Woman Consciousness among Alabama Missionaries."

woman missionary, whether married or single, was never merely an “associate missionary.” She was expected to and did have a significant ministry role. If they were not nurses or doctors, many missionary women preached and taught.

Other social ministries included the expanding medical work, which provided contacts with potential converts. Mission agencies of other denominations opened hospitals in China as well. The N.H.A. maintained dispensaries. Both the Southern Baptists and Presbyterians, had hospitals in Shandong Province.<sup>33</sup>

For the Nazarenes, Bresee Memorial Hospital in Daming became an important ministry. The Women’s Foreign Missionary Society and California laypersons undertook the building project. C. J. Kinne, a Nazarene publisher who had spearheaded the fundraising, and who late in life married Susan Bresee, the daughter of Phineas Bresee, went to China to oversee the building’s construction. When completed in 1925, the hospital accommodated 100 beds. A nurses’ training school began soon after, with missionary nurses as instructors. The hospital was designed, as Kinne wrote, to be both a “Good Samaritan” to relieve the sufferings of the people and an evangel of mercy to lead them to Christ.<sup>34</sup> Both motives were there, both paradigms represented: that of ministering to people simply out of love, and that of evangelizing them through medicine. The social and evangelical components of the work were held in balance, though the hospital seemed to need to justify its existence in the years ahead by appealing to its evangelistic role. Despite

---

<sup>33</sup>Cary, *Story of the National Holiness Missionary Society*, 171-176; Flynt and Berkley, *Taking Christianity to China*, 181-189; G. Thompson Brown, *Earthen Vessels and Transcendent Power: American Presbyterians in China, 1837-1952* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 1997), 221-225, 232.

<sup>34</sup>C.J. Kinne, *Our Field in China: The Field and the Mission of the Church of the Nazarene in China Briefly Described and Illustrated* (KC: NPH, n.d.), 13. See also C. J. Kinne, *The Modern Samaritan: A Presentation of the Claims of Medical Missions* (KC: NPH, n.d.); Swim, *History*, 99-100; Osborn, *Hitherto!*, 15-21.

fundamentalist pressures, the Nazarenes kept their medical, educational and other social work through the years in China.<sup>35</sup>

Medical doctor R. G. Fitz arrived in 1920. He was in charge of the medical work for several years. But Fitz felt called to evangelism, and the mission secured other doctors, both Chinese and missionaries, to help him in the hospital.<sup>36</sup>

The hospital's workers were instrumental in initiating a revival that swept through the Nazarene mission in 1926-1927—right to the eve of a nationalist rebellion that swept the country.<sup>37</sup>

Dr. C. E. West, in charge of the hospital during Fitz's furlough, began to pray for revival while recuperating from smallpox. Missionaries at the Daming compound set a daily prayer time, 11:30-12:00 noon, which was later extended. Soon the Chinese workers and students

---

<sup>35</sup>See, for example, "P. F. Bresee Memorial Hospital for Ta Ming Fu, China," pamphlet published by Nazarene Medical Missionary Union (file 451-44); Henry C. Wesche, *Medical Missions: What? Why? How?* (KC: General Board, Church of the Nazarene, n.d.); Francis C. Sutherland, *China Crisis* (KC: NPH, 1948), 86-94. On the financing of the hospital see Swim, *History*, 99-100. The Nazarene Medical Missionary Union was organized in California in 1921 to promote medical missions. See also Hinshaw, *Messengers*, 117. On the broader debate see William R. Hutchison, *Errand to the World: American Protestant Thought and Foreign Missions* (Chicago: U. of Chicago Press, 1987), ch. 5.

<sup>36</sup>Smith to Reynolds, November 26, 1926; Zella W. Deale, "Hospital Work and Workers," [1931] (file 213-13); Hinshaw, *Messengers of the Cross in China*, 51-56; Maxine F. Fritz, *But God Gives A song: The Story of Dr. and Mrs. R. G. Fitz, Pioneer Missionaries to China and Alaska* (KC: NPH, 1973), 46-47, and throughout. Similarly, medical doctor T. W. Ayers of the Southern Baptist hospital in Shandong Province preferred evangelism to medicine. See Flynt and Berkley, *Taking Christianity to China*, 186.

<sup>37</sup>A. J. Smith, "A Word with the Supporters of Native Workers," *The China Nazarene* (March 1926), 8 (file 628-8). See also Smith, "Report," Proceedings of the Fifth Annual Council, China District, September 1926 (file 406-22).

petitioned to have their own prayer meeting. Missionaries themselves felt spiritually transformed.<sup>38</sup>

Aaron J. Smith, the Nazarene field superintendent at this time (while Kiehn was on furlough), became convinced that not only was he himself as yet unsanctified, but unsaved. Smith (originally “Schmidt”) was the brother of Anna Kiehn and had Mennonite background. He had attended both Central Holiness College in Iowa and Chicago Theological Seminary. He pastored Congregationalist and Evangelical churches in America while applying to become a Nazarene missionary. He had little direct acquaintance with the Church of the Nazarene before he arrived in China in 1920. He became so burdened with guilt, during the 1926 revival, that he confessed his faults to his Chinese houseboy and to a mason on the compound, both of whom he believed he had offended. Further confessions to the Chinese demonstrated to them Smith’s complete humility. Prayer and study, including the reading of John Wesley’s *A Plain Account of Christian Perfection*, followed. Then, Smith testified, “the Holy Spirit came upon me like an electric current and vibrated through my whole soul and body.” Smith pointedly assured Reynolds that though he felt himself baptized with the Holy Ghost and fire, he did not speak in unknown tongues but only praised God with a loud voice in English.<sup>39</sup>

To the worry of holiness missionaries, Pentecostalism was growing in China. One of the missionaries formerly affiliated with the Houlding mission had returned to China in 1908 after receiving the “Pentecostal blessing” of speaking in tongues at Azusa Street in Los Angeles. He and

---

<sup>38</sup>A. J. Smith, *Jesus Lifting Chinese: Marvelous Spiritual Awakenings in China* (Cincinnati: God’s Bible School and Revivalist, n.d.), 18-37 and throughout. Some of the more radical statements about the revival were down played in *Other Sheep*. See Hinshaw, *Messengers*, 72-74. See also Smith to Reynolds, December 16, 1926; January 10, [1927]; February 1, 1927; Osborn to Smith, n.d. (file 214-52); Reynolds to Smith, March 5, 1927.

<sup>39</sup>Smith to Reynolds, April 22, 1926. See Hinshaw, *Messengers*, 67-74.

others established a Pentecostal mission in Zhengding, about half way between Handan and Beijing.<sup>40</sup>

Spiritual deepening experiences like Smith's, if not so extreme, took place among other Nazarene missionaries and soon the revival touched the Chinese. The revival helped to convince the missionaries that the Chinese were spiritually capable of both maintaining and advancing the church. In the missionaries' minds signs of spiritual maturity were related to spiritual crisis experiences and external manifestations: When Chinese asked forgiveness from one another, testified to receiving the Holy Spirit, and voiced loud "hallelujahs" and "amens," the missionaries concluded, as the mission policy statement said, that men and women demonstrated spiritual victory in the same way across cultures. Smith typified this sentiment: "When the Holy Ghost gets hold of a man, I care not of what nation or tribe or language he may be, there will be the same manifestation of the Holy Spirit which has been peculiar to all the holy people of all ages."<sup>41</sup> Osborn realized that he had been mistaken as to how the Chinese would react once they "got through." He felt that he had limited God and by his pessimism had been a stumbling block to some.<sup>42</sup>

Now Osborn saw Chinese tithing voluntarily, witnessing spontaneously, and catching a vision for the work. West even stated that it was time for the missionaries to stand aside to let God work through the

---

<sup>40</sup> On Pentecostalism see Daniel H. Bays, "Indigenous Protestant Churches in China, 1900-1937: A Pentecostal Case Study," in *Indigenous Responses to Western Christianity*, ed. Steven Kaplan (New York: New York U. Press, 1995), 130; and Bays, "The Protestant Missionary Establishment and the Pentecostal Movement," in *Pentecostal Currents in American Protestantism*, eds. Edith L. Blumhofer, Russell P. Spittler, and Grant A. Wacker (Urbana: U. of Illinois Press, 1999), 55, and regarding the influence of Pentecostalism upon other holiness missions in China see pp. 55-61.

<sup>41</sup>A. J. Smith, *Jesus Lifting Chinese: Marvelous Spiritual Awakenings in China* (Cincinnati: God's Bible School and Revivalist, n.d.), 26.

<sup>42</sup>Smith, *Jesus Lifting*, 36.

Chinese. Before, West now realized, some Chinese had been so dependent on missionaries that they had neither sought spiritual victory for themselves, nor thought themselves even so worthy. Similarly, Smith, after the revival crested, believed that God was able to carry on His "own work in His own way among the Chinese . . . perhaps even better than the foreigners."<sup>43</sup> Leaders in Kansas City did not return Smith to China after his furlough in 1927, but they could not help his speaking widely of his experiences throughout the denomination. His book on the China revival, *Jesus Lifting Chinese*, was not published by the Church of the Nazarene, the leaders of which were understandably embarrassed. Had they sent out a missionary who, as he now confessed, had not even been saved when he had arrived on the field?<sup>44</sup>

The revival at the Bible Training School in Daming affirmed both the spiritual character of the educational work and the capabilities of the students. The school was led by Francis C. Sutherland, a Canadian educated at Montreal Theological College (M.A. and S.T.L.). He had worked with the Student Volunteer Movement before venturing as a Nazarene missionary to China in 1920. The school began in 1923 with a two-year course. Thirty students of varying educational backgrounds

---

<sup>43</sup>Smith to Reynolds, April 12, 1927. See Smith, *Jesus Lifting*, 42, 55, 69, 110. The widespread nature of the revival is evident in Smith, *Jesus Lifting*, 213-234; Mary K. Crawford, *The Shandong Revival* (Shanghai: Baptist Publication Society, 1933); Carey, *Story*, 210-215; and Daniel Bays, "Christian Revival in China," in *Modern Christian Revivals*, eds. Edith Blumhofer and Randall Balmer (Urbana: U. of Illinois Press, 1993), 168-169, 172-174. See also Leslie T. Lyall, *John Sung* (London: China Inland Mission, 1954), and John Sung, *My Testimony: The Autobiography of Dr. John Sung* (Reprint, Hongkong: Living Books for All, 1977).

<sup>44</sup>Smith, *Jesus Lifting*, 18-19, 36, 70-88, 109. See Smith, *Bible Holiness and the Modern, Popular, Spurious* (N.p., [1953]), 92-95; Victor P. Reasoner, "The American Holiness Movement's Paradigm Shift Concerning Holiness," *Wesleyan Theological Journal* 31 (Fall 1996), 139-140.



enrolled. Students paid their own way. Nevertheless, there were always more applicants for admission than the school was able to care for.<sup>45</sup>

When the revival came upon the mission compound in 1926, Sutherland dismissed the school sessions, and Chinese teachers and students scattered to their hometowns. In this way the revival spread throughout the Nazarene field. This was a very different student activity than what had transpired some time earlier, when the same Bible school students had taken to the streets of Daming making speeches against foreigners.<sup>46</sup>

Though mostly abated in the Nazarene mission by the revival, anti-foreign feeling in China rampaged in 1926-1927. Though, for the most part, missionaries opposed the “extraterritoriality” privileges being demanded by foreign governments of the Chinese, new restrictions imposed by the Guomindang government of Chiang Kai-shek forced many primary schools run by missions, including those of the Church of the Nazarene, to close. The government required not only that schools register, but that each day students stand three minutes in silence and bow in reverence to a picture of Sun Yat Sen. By 1927 anti-foreignism was so strong that about 50 percent of all missionaries in China left their fields. In March of that year Nazarene missionaries took refuge in Tianjin, where the N.H.A. maintained a mission station and Bible school, and stayed there until June, when many of the missionaries, including Smith, returned to North America for furloughs. Some never returned to China. Their consolation was their newly found confidence in the Chinese to carry on the work.<sup>47</sup>

---

<sup>45</sup>“Annual Station Report: Daming,” 1923; Hinshaw, *Messengers*, 75-81; Sutherland, *China Crisis*, 77-78. See also Robert Sutherland and John Sutherland, *Behind the Silence: The Story of Frank and Ann Sutherland* (KC: NPH, 1999)

<sup>46</sup>Smith, *Jesus Lifting*, 27-33, 55, 107; Smith to Reynolds, December 16, 1926, and January 10, [1927].

<sup>47</sup>L. A. Reed and H. A. Wiese, *The Challenge of China* (KC: Nazarene, 1937), 60-64; Dorothy Borg, *American Policy and the Chinese Revolution, 1925-1928* (Reprint, New York: Octagon, 1968), 361; Thomson, *While China Faced West*, 35-40.

The political situation reified in their minds, and in the minds of their missionary colleagues in other missions, the urgency of establishing firmly the Chinese church. Beyond this, and what the insurgency meant for the continuation of their ministries, Nazarene missionaries expressed little interest in Chinese politics. To a degree, it may have been the German Mennonite background of many of the Nazarene missions in China that created ambivalence toward wider political concerns—but holiness people in general in the 1920s, including those in the United States, drew away from social responsibilities.<sup>48</sup>

### **A Sense of Urgency**

Chiang Kai-shek stabilized matters somewhat by establishing a national government under the Guomindang in Beijing, and missionaries returned to the field in mid-1928. Under the pressures of nationalism, like other Protestant missionaries at the same time, Nazarenes returned under greater anti-foreign fervor and violent civil turmoil, but with renewed commitments toward establishing a self-reliant church. Unlike some Presbyterian, American Board, Methodist and other missionaries, Nazarenes did not envision even in these tumultuous times joining the wider Christian community in a united Protestant church. The strong denominational distinctives of the church kept Nazarenes apart from such possibilities.<sup>49</sup>

Peter Kiehn resumed his role as mission director after returning from furlough in 1928. Like other successful pioneer missionaries,

---

<sup>48</sup>“Proceedings of the Fifth Annual Council,” September 1927; Smith, “China’s Future Yet Hopeful,” June 1927; Latourette, *Christian Missions in China*, 699; Borg, *American Policy*, 363. On missionaries’ concerns with the political situation see Borg, *American Policy*, 68-94, 194, 429; and Shirley Sone Garrett, “Why They Stayed: American Church Politics and Chinese nationalism in the Twenties,” in *The Missionary Enterprise in China and America*, ed. Fairbank, 295-302, 308-310.

<sup>49</sup> See Lian Xi, *The Conversion of Missionaries: Liberalism in American Protestant Missions in China, 1907-1932* (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State U. Press, 1997), 165-167.

Kiehn remained “self-confident, temperamentally certain, and occasionally self-assertive.”<sup>50</sup> He favored a complete organization of the China district. Especially given the political and social situation, it was necessary, said Kiehn, for missionaries to stay in the background and to serve as advisers while training Chinese workers. He had full confidence in the Chinese people’s spiritual readiness. Kiehn found that they received and experienced entire sanctification in the “old fashioned” holiness way. He believed that Chinese pastors possessed a sense of belongingness to the church, and that Chinese laypersons would support it. With the aim of eventually ending all foreign support, Kiehn believed that the mission’s money should be used to open new work rather than to support already-established churches and their pastors. But Kiehn found that his ideas and his methods were not always acceptable to fellow missionaries.<sup>51</sup>

There was greater urgency toward self-support and self-government during the lean years preceding and during the Great Depression. The sharp decline in giving for missions limited the general church’s expenditures overseas. J. G. Morrison, foreign missions secretary, sent a letter in 1930 to the Chinese church that plainly related the problem. He stated that the Chinese should cooperate with the missionaries, while each congregation should support its own pastor by tithing, fasting and praying. If they were able to do so, Morrison wrote, the general church could open new fields among the unreached in other parts of China, as well as in the Philippines and portions of Europe. He appealed to the Chinese church’s own sense of mission. Morrison knew as well that for either political or economic reasons missionaries might at any time be

---

<sup>50</sup>See the general personality profile in Valentin Rabe, “Evangelical Logistics: Mission Support and Resources to 1920,” in Fairbank, ed., *The Missionary Enterprise in China and America*, 75.

<sup>51</sup>Kiehn, “The Past, Present and Future of the Church of the Nazarene,” [1926] (file 604-15); “Council Minutes,” May 1, 1930; Kiehn, “Legacy,” 75.

forced out of China, and he wanted the Chinese church's own leaders to be ready.<sup>52</sup>

In preparation for this, in 1931 the missionaries allowed the Chinese to choose eight Chinese pastors to compose a District Board, one step toward greater self-government. Among the pastors on the board was Hsu Kwei-pin, the only Chinese elder who had been ordained in 1929 by General Superintendents Roy T. Williams and John Goodwin. Formerly affiliated with both the Presbyterian Church and Houlding's South Chili Gospel Mission, Hsu pastored Nazarene churches in Chaocheng and Daming, where he also served as a teacher in the Bible school. Another leader on the Board was Wu Tung-tai, who worked in the bandit-plagued area of Peikao before transferring to Chichei. He and his wife evangelized through tent meetings.<sup>53</sup>

By early 1933 six Chinese workers felt bold enough to ask for a say and a vote in mission council proceedings, on equal footing with missionaries. There was still no officially organized district assembly in China. What had formerly been called such were really mission council meetings that extended certain privileges to the Chinese—sponsoring annual meetings with representatives from the churches and outstations. But the composition and purpose of these meetings were not defined in Nazarene polity. The Chinese workers felt criticism from outsiders about the work being run totally by foreigners. They also questioned whether the missionaries who routinely assigned workers to various jobs and locations were following policy which they knew emphasized the training and education of Chinese workers. The request signaled the desire of Chinese leaders for more self-determination.<sup>54</sup>

---

<sup>52</sup>J. G. Morrison to "Our Chinese Church Members and Converts," June 28, 1930, and Morrison's report in the "Minutes," 1931. See also Osborn, *China*, 52-53.

<sup>53</sup>"Minutes of the China Council," 1931; Hinshaw, *Native Torch Bearers*, 42-44, 51-53.

<sup>54</sup>"Minutes of the Nazarene China District Council," February 8-10, 1933.

Actually there may have been an additional, hidden agenda in the request of the Chinese, if, as missionaries surmised, Peter Kiehn prompted them toward this action. The autocratic leadership of Kiehn came to a point of exasperation for the other missionaries who forced Kiehn from the superintendency of the mission in January 1933. Earlier the missionaries had voiced their complaints to headquarters officials about Kiehn not adhering to policies, including that of holding an election for the superintendency. They wondered if Kansas City had given him some “extraordinary powers” that placed both him and the field outside of missions policies and *Manual* requirements. They were, they said, distressed and confused. Morrison sent Kiehn a telegraph in October 1932 instructing him to hold a council meeting and to retain the superintendency—if elected. Policies were in force in China, Morrison instructed Kiehn. Though Kiehn held the meeting, he did not call for an election. There followed another spate of telegrams back and forth between the missionaries and Morrison. Finally, Kiehn resigned. Morrison then appointed Harry A. Wiese to convene a council meeting, which was held in February 1933. At the meeting the Kiehns protested nearly every proposal generated by the other missionaries, especially the one that transferred them from Daming to Chaocheng. They walked out of the meeting in protest. The Kiehns proposed that they be stationed at Kwangping, to the north, if they must leave. Then, after this seemed to be agreed upon by all, they changed their minds and requested to move to Chaocheng after all, where, they hoped, they might have charge of the surrounding area and be accountable directly to Morrison rather than to the other missionaries.<sup>55</sup>

In the meantime Kiehn raised some Chinese leaders’ ire against Wiese, who the missionaries had elected superintendent. Morrison (who at the same time was trying to work through the situation with Staples and Kitagawa in Japan) accused Kiehn for plotting against the mission

---

<sup>55</sup>“Minutes of the Nazarene China District Council,” February 8-10, 1933; telegram to Kiehn, October 11, 1932; [China missionaries] to General Board, October 28, 1932; Morrison to Kiehn, November 26, 1932; telegrams to Kiehn, January 13 and 26, 1933.

and chastised him for raising up a pro-Kiehn faction among the Chinese. When Morrison sought advice on the problems in China from members of the foreign missions department of the General Board and the General Superintendents, most admonished Morrison to recall Kiehn from the field. Nevertheless, since J. B. Chapman planned to visit China as well as Japan in 1935, Morrison postponed action. He hoped that the General Superintendent could solve some of the problems.<sup>56</sup>

Before Chapman's arrival, the General Board received remarkable letters from Chinese leaders seemingly in support of Kiehn. But the letters expressed more than that, a longing for autonomy. The Chinese leaders stated that they realized that Kiehn had faults. They wished that he would confess them to the Lord. Nevertheless they wanted Kiehn to remain. Many older Chinese, they reminded the General Board, had been converted under his ministry. The Chinese leaders criticized Wiese for being a "typewriter missionary." But they thought the factionalism that was wrecking the field was even worse than the faults of either Kiehn or Wiese. Though they were grateful for the money given from America for the Chinese church, the leaders stated: "We do not hope to receive such help financially, also we hope that the time will come when we will not need people of other countries to preach for us. We sincerely hope that we can be free, that is self-supporting and propagating . . . that we may help the poor and needy in our land." The sentiments of the Chinese leaders demonstrated a certain nationalism as well as sense of spiritual equality in the face of the wrangles among the missionaries. By this time, they seemed to say, after 20 years of Nazarene missions work in the area, the financial commitments of the

---

<sup>56</sup>L. C. Osborn, E. Osborn, R.G. Fitz, Mrs. R.G. Fitz, H. Wiese, C. Wiese, and Catherine Flagler to General Board, Department of Foreign Missions, October 28, 1932 (file 453-28); "Minutes of the Council Meeting," 1934; Wiese to Morrison, July 25, 1934 and February 23, 1935; Morrison to Wiese, January 11, 1935; Kiehn to Morrison, February 22, 1935; Morrison to Kiehn, July 19, 1935. Compare Cunningham, "Mission Policy and National Leadership in the Church of the Nazarene: Japan, 1905-1965," *Wesleyan Theological Journal* 28 (Spring-Fall 1993), 128-164.

church were about all the justification left for retaining any of the missionaries.<sup>57</sup>

Wiese was already moving toward transferring responsibilities to the Chinese church, but his programs were misunderstood by them. He thought of self-support as “a means to increase the spiritual vitality of the churches.” Wiese believed that the incentive for self-support was greater self-government, wherein a pastor would be, as he should be, held accountable to the local congregation. One of his other concerns was that the local churches have the titles to their own property. But he felt that simply giving it to them outright would not generate either a sense of stewardship or ownership. The land had been purchased, of course, by the mission, but the mission never intended to hold the property permanently. Wiese suggested that local churches buy the land from the mission at one-twentieth of its cost each year for 20 years. After the final payment the property would be turned over to a proposed central church organization under the Chinese. But the Chinese leaders argued that the property already purchased did not rightly belong to the mission, but to the church—and they were the church as much as anyone. They wanted the property transferred to them without any payments on their part.<sup>58</sup>

Thus when Chapman arrived in October 1935, high on his agenda were the clarification of the relationship between the Chinese churches and the mission council, and the placement of the Kiehns. Chapman saw that policy concerning the maintenance of strict separation between the mission council and the Chinese church was not being followed. This led to confusion on the part of the Chinese leaders who wanted to control the stationing of national workers and to have a say in how money was spent. The problem was compounded by there being no real district assembly.

---

<sup>57</sup>Translations of the Chinese letters (undated) are in file 453-29.

<sup>58</sup>Wiese, “Question of Organizing District Assembly,” and “The Subject of Self-support--China,” to Morrison and Chapman, December 1, 1934 (file 453-28).

In response, Chapman reminded both the missionaries and the Chinese leaders that the aim of the church was to develop “self-directing and self-supporting” churches. Problems commonly arose, Chapman told them, when the indigenous church clamored for self-direction before it achieved self-support. He assured the Chinese that the missionaries would stay only as long as necessary, meaning, until the churches were able financially to carry on for themselves. “And just as we hope that the indigenous church may become self-directing and self-supporting, the mission must remain so itself, and when this is impossible or unnecessary, the mission should be definitely withdrawn and the field left to the indigenous church.” The Chinese church was to have full control over all the finances it raised, Chapman reminded everyone, and the missionaries were to serve only as advisers regarding such. In the same way the finances from the general church channeled through the mission council were to be used totally at the missionaries’ discretion. This meant, Chapman further explained, that when mission money was used to support a worker, he or she would be stationed wherever the missionaries deemed best.

Chapman allowed the Chinese Annual Meeting to continue in the place of full district organization, despite the fact that there were no provisions in policy for such. Chapman also told the missionaries and Chinese workers, “There is the strongest bond in the world that binds us together, and that is our love for the Lord Jesus Christ. This bond is stronger than blood or race or language . . . and it is sufficient to make us one in both purpose and effort. We want to spread His Kingdom everywhere because of our love for Him.”<sup>59</sup>

Apparently there were enough tensions between Chinese leaders and missionaries to warrant both the admonitions that Chapman gave

---

<sup>59</sup>Chapman, “To the China Mission Council,” in a report to the General Superintendents, Department of Foreign Mission and General Board, Church of the Nazarene, with a cover letter to [Emma] Word, December 31 [1935].



and his cautiousness toward the Chinese government of the church. None were ordained by Chapman at this time.<sup>60</sup>

Chapman then tackled the problem with the Kiehns. Chapman felt that much of the turmoil resulted from having too many missionaries stationed in Daming, and from their having too little supervision from the general church. He realistically noted that the strain between the Kiehns and the other missionaries was “practically unbearable,” and concurred with the plan to send the Kiehns to Kwangping, where they might have charge of four counties in Hebei Province, in the northwestern reaches of the field. But he also believed that Wiese, whom the missionaries again elected superintendent of the field while Chapman was present, should be stationed in Chaocheng, to spearhead the work in the southeastern end. Osborn would have temporary charge of the Bible school and Fitz the hospital, so that both could remain in Daming. Chapman hoped that by separating these leaders the talents of all would be maximized. He genuinely believed that the decentralization of the missionaries was best for the fullest evangelization of the field. The Kiehns seemed reconciled at the council meeting. With Chapman there, they apologized to the other missionaries on several counts.<sup>61</sup>

Regarding the hospital work, Chapman was impressed with both Dr. Henry Wesche, a N.H.A. missionary who was giving part-time service to the Nazarene work, and Dr. Feng Lan-xin, who was proving to be a “true Christian and a good surgeon, and a tireless worker.” Chapman hoped that Feng, a graduate of Shandong Christian University and School of Medicine, who spoke English well, and who was paid a higher salary than other Chinese workers, would stay permanently at Bresee Hospital. But within a short time the doctor left the Nazarene

---

<sup>60</sup>Chapman, “To the China Mission Council,” and Chapman, “To the pastors and people of the Chinese section of the Church of the Nazarene,” contained in the same report; “Minutes of the China Council, Church of the Nazarene,” [1935] (file 604-15).

<sup>61</sup>Chapman, report to the General Superintendents, 1935; “Minutes of the China Council,” [1935].

work and joined the Jesus Family Movement. This was an indigenous sect that emphasized spiritual gifts and the imminent return of Jesus.<sup>62</sup>

Other doctors—both Chinese and missionary—followed for brief periods. Hester Hayne worked at the hospital as a nurse from 1921 to 1926. Following her evacuation in 1926 and furlough, she finished a M.D. degree at the University of Kansas. Returning to China in 1934, she continued studies at the Peking Union Medical Center and served at Bresee Hospital from 1936 to 1941. In the meantime, Wesche as well had become full-time with the Nazarene mission.<sup>63</sup>

The Bible School reopened in the fall of 1935 under Osborn. While operating from 1923 to 1928 as a two-year course, only one class had graduated. During the interim years missionaries sent the most promising pastors elsewhere, such as to the N.H.A. school in Tianjin, for their education. After several years on furlough, Sutherland returned in 1936 to resume charge of the school. The structured and regimented life of the students, along with the tuition they paid (which made the school self-supporting) neither dampened the spiritual ardor of the students nor

---

<sup>62</sup>Chapman, report to the General Superintendents; “Minutes of the China Council” [1935]; Wiese to Jones, July 16, 1946; Susan N. Fitkin and Emma B. Word, *Nazarene Missions in the Orient* (KC: NPH, n.d.), 87; and conversations with John W. Pattee and the son of Feng, Feng Ke-yi, Beijing, China, May 23, 1989. The elder Dr. Feng served as a surgeon throughout the years of war with Japan, and then he served as a medical doctor with the Red Army. On the Jesus Family Movement see D. Vaughan Rees, *The “Jesus Family” in Communist China* (Chicago: Moody, 1956), especially p. 58; Philip L. Wickeri, *Seeking the Common Ground: Protestant Christianity, the Three-Self Movement, and China’s United Front* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 1988), 160-162; and Daniel Bays, “The Growth of Independent Christianity,” in Bays, ed., *Christianity in China*, 312. Eventually Feng left the Jesus Family and his leanings, and those of his family, returned to those teachings he had learned while working with the Church of the Nazarene. See Maxine F. Fritz, “By Faith Alone,” *World Mission* 12 (May 1986), 12-13; Feng Ke-ye, “Perseverance through Persecution,” *World Mission* 18 (April 1992), 4-5, 14-15. On Wesche see “Minutes of the Council Meeting,” 1934.

<sup>63</sup>Hinshaw, *Messengers of the Cross in China*, 86-91; Zella Deale, “Hospital Work and Workers”; *World Mission* (September 1984), 16.

hindered numbers from applying. In fact many were turned away for lack of housing on the compound. About 130 were enrolled in the late 1930s. Among the teachers was Hsu, who was made vice-president in 1939. He and other teachers emphasized evangelism. The school regularly sent bands of students into the field to evangelize. One group sent into Daming County in 1939, for instance, included 68 workers who visited 133 villages and preached to over 22,000 people. One large class was prepared for graduation in 1940, and another smaller one for 1941.<sup>64</sup>

Among the Chinese educators beside Hsu was Lu Yu-cheng, dean of men. Sutherland noted that Lu gave all his spare time to preaching and giving personal advice to students. When Lu was killed in a Japanese attack on Chengan in 1938, Sutherland remarked: "I feel personally that I have lost one of my best friends."<sup>65</sup>

By all accounts the most outstanding student, frequently employed as an evangelist even while studying, was Chang Chin. He came from a Christian family of modest means and was converted during a revival in Daming in 1927, when he was about 13 years old. However, unable to get the education he desired, he joined the army of General Feng Yuxiang, a warlord with ties to the Soviet Union, and became a Communist. He became the leader of the Communists in his village of Yuchachai. During a revival that the renowned Dr. Song Shangjie (John Sung) held at Daming in 1935, Chang decided to leave politics. Soon he entered the Bible school. A zealous worker, his success in making

---

<sup>64</sup>"Report of Committee on Memorials" (n.d. [received at headquarters December 16, 1938]); Wiese, "The Bible School Our Life Line," *Other Sheep* (April 1939): 24-25; Wiese, "Bible School Evangelistic Bands," *Other Sheep* (June 1939), 16-17; Sutherland, *China Crisis*, 77-81; J. Fred Parker, *Mission to the World: A History of Missions in the Church of the Nazarene through 1985* (KC: NPH, 1988), 257-258.

<sup>65</sup>Sutherland to C. W. Jones, February 2, 1938. See also Pattee, "Late News from China," *Other Sheep* (May 1938): 24.

converts even during these early years was greater than more experienced pastors.<sup>66</sup>

The work of Chang typified the evangelistic fervor of the field in the late 1930s. Missionaries such as John Pattee were involved in village evangelism. He trained a succession of Chinese understudies, students at the Bible school, in preaching and soul winning by traveling with them from town to town. Protégés of Pattee included Kao E-feng, who was an atheist before his conversion; Chi Yuew-han (John Chi), who was raised by zealous Buddhists, but who also had a Presbyterian background; Li Sui-chung, who was from a poor family, and was influenced to become a Christian through the relief work undertaken by the church during famine times; Shang Chih-rung, whose father had been a worker with the Houlding mission; and Yuan Hsuan-ch'un (Allen Yuan), whom Pattee met while undertaking language study in Beijing. Yuan also worked in the late 1930s with Song Shangjie (John Sung). The evangelistic teams attracted crowds of 500 or 600 at village fairs and market days.<sup>67</sup>

---

<sup>66</sup>Katherine Wiese, "Chang Chin," *Other Sheep* (February 1942): 23-24. Other accounts of Chang's ministry are Pattee, "Pressing the Battle," *Other Sheep* (February 1941): 21; Pattee, "The Chengan Revival," *Other Sheep* (August 1940): 15-16; Osborn, "Revivals in China," *Other Sheep* (August 1940), 16; Wiese, "Bible School Turns Out an Evangelist," *Other Sheep* (January 1939): 24; Sutherland, "Chin T'an Chen," *Other Sheep* (November 1937): 23; Osborn, *Hitherto*, 28; Pattee, *Hazardous Days*, 45-46; conversations between Wang Yu-xian and Pattee, May 29, 1989, at Daming; between Shang Chih-rung and Pattee, May 31, 1989, at Chengan; and between Li Bae-ch'in and Pattee, June 1, 1989, at Handan. On the evangelist John Sung's ties to the holiness movement churches see Lyall, *John Sung*, 55, 59, 67, 95, 106, 108, 112, 150. Daming is mentioned on p. 106. See also Fritz, *But God Gives a Song*, 62.

<sup>67</sup>Pattee, *Hazardous Days in China*, 39-43; Lillian Pattee, "Three Hour Testimony Meeting," *Other Sheep* (February 1941), 24; Osborn to Remiss Rehfeldt, February 5, 1955; and, regarding the last two named, conversations in China, May 16, 19 and 31, 1989. See the report on this trip on file in the Nazarene Archives. See also C. Ellen Watts, *John Pattee of China and the Philippines* (Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1984), 51-66.

The sound of artillery punctuated the evangelistic services, however, when the Japanese moved to conquer northern China in 1937. This followed episodes with Chinese bandits, and a time of famine, flooding and even earthquake. When the Japanese invaded, missionaries hung a large American flag prominently in the center of the mission compound. As the Japanese still did not want to widen the war, this protected the missionaries and Chinese workers for a time. The compound thus served as a refuge for Chinese workers. In 1938 Japanese ground troops reached Daming. By this time, following the warnings of American Secretary of State Cordell Hull, most American missionaries had already evacuated their fields. Except for Wiese, the Nazarene missionaries fled again to Tianjin, on the coast. Indeed the Chinese deemed Wiese's willingness to stay and suffer with them during the siege of their city heroic. The war destroyed the large church at Chaocheng, along with missionary residences there. The Japanese allowed missionaries to return to the field in 1939. The missionaries, themselves deeply disturbed by the Japanese and empathetic to the plight of the Chinese, sensed that the Chinese people were now open to the gospel more than ever. Prayer meetings and even evangelistic bands continued to meet and spread the message of salvation under the eyes of the Japanese occupation forces.<sup>68</sup>

Even though Wiese was a cautious leader in this regard, the church made identifiable progress toward the indigenization of leadership. Wiese realized that as long as money from the United States supplied the various needs of the field, there was little incentive for self-support. Like other missionaries, he worried that if the Chinese were Christian

---

<sup>68</sup>Sutherland to Jones, August 25, 1937, November 4, 1937, and February 2, 1938; Wiese, telegram to KC, September 15, 1937; Cordell Hull, telegram to Church of the Nazarene, January 14, 1938; Wiese, "When Duty Calls," *Other Sheep* (December 1937), 21-2; "Preparing for War," *Other Sheep* (December 1937), 24-25; Pattee, "Seeing Our China Field," *Other Sheep* (June 1938), 20-21; Pattee, *Hazardous*, 40-41; Sutherland, *China Crisis*, 95-98; Osborn, *Hitherto*, 8-9, 41-46. See also Dorothy Borg, *The United States and the Far Eastern Crisis of 1933-1938: From the Manchurian Incident through the Initial Stage of the Undeclared Sino-Japanese War* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard U. Press, 1964), 328-329.

only for material benefit—if they were only “rice Christians”—the church was not really the church. When churches erected their own buildings, as did the congregation in Pei-i-ko in Puchow County, and when they sponsored their own evangelistic campaigns, it pleased Wiese. Even whether the mission should provide a thin soup to all who attended various district meetings seemed to Wiese a matter of self-support, and the mission stopped the practice.

Wiese also believed that the second generation of Christians more than the first would be ready to carry on the church. Only in the second generation were certain Christian moral and ethical standards able to replace the cultural, he said. Whereas the first generation of converts often were only “nominal,” succeeding generations were truly “evangelical.”<sup>69</sup>

Wiese’s assessments regarding the spiritual nature of the Chinese Christians were more pessimistic than Kiehn’s and others’ had been, especially during the previous revival. By the 1930s the older leaders had been Christians for nearly a generation, and a new, strong band of young leaders was emerging that naturally desired more independence. Wiese’s attitudes reflected the hesitancies of missionaries to sufficiently trust the local church that they themselves nurtured—or, a hesitancy to relinquish their own positions as church leaders.

In 1939 the foreign missions secretary, C. W. Jones, set a policy for all of the fields by which all general church money would be used for starting new work—rather than supporting the existing. This plan would be phased in slowly. Indeed in China the church still had not reached 4,000 villages in the Nazarene field. The local Chinese churches, so challenged, agreed to cover immediately ten to forty percent of their pastors’ salaries and other expenses. When a change of pastors at the Daming church was necessary in 1940 due to the increased responsibilities of Hsu Kwei-pin in district affairs, the mission

---

<sup>69</sup>Reed and Wiese, *The Challenge of China*, 71-75; Wiese, “Chinese Hire Three Men to Preach,” *Other Sheep* (July 1937), 21; Wiese, “More Self-Support,” *Other Sheep* (May 1937), 13.

required the church's deacons to provide a full salary to the man they chose as their new pastor, Yu Wan-ch'ien.<sup>70</sup>

In turn, Chinese leaders in September 1940 pressed for a "Committee of Twenty-Four," which might have the right to hold the Annual Meetings when sanctioned by the General Board, and to both hire and dismiss workers if war forced the missionaries again to leave the field. The Committee was to include ten lay persons, and to have a five-member executive committee with a chairman, Hsu Kwei-pin, who was still the only ordained pastor. In fact the Chinese promised to care for the missionaries in case their salaries and other support from America should be cut off due to the war. No formal action was taken on this plan, which had no justification in either the Nazarene *Manual* or mission policy. But at this point, with war looming closer, the missionaries felt that they could not yet anticipate what course of action might be necessary. In the meantime they prepared to nominate several others for ordination.<sup>71</sup>

In early 1941 missionaries further strengthened Chinese leadership by placing Hsu in charge of the Bible school and designating him to become "Chairman" of the district if the missionaries left. They had faith in Hsu, who had worked closely together with Wiese for years. Indeed, as Katherine Wiese later described it, Wiese and Hsu "worked together like one man; they loved each other and had faith in the other. Truly Hsu was co-Superintendent as Brother Wiese always consulted him on Chinese problems. . . . These two men had worked together constantly for nearly eleven years. Sometimes Hsu was head sometimes

---

<sup>70</sup>Katherine Wiese, "Phenomenal Growth of the China N.F.M.S.," *Other Sheep* (December 1940), 12-13; Osborn, "Self-Support in the Church of the Nazarene in China," *Other Sheep* (February 1941), 24. See Pattee, "Notes from Chengan," *Other Sheep* (July 1941), 11.

<sup>71</sup>"China District of the Church of the Nazarene Council Minutes," September-October 1940; Osborn to Jones, November 6, 1940.

Brother Wiese but I don't believe either thought of who was boss. They were workers together and loved each other like David and Jonathan."<sup>72</sup>

On personal levels, perhaps even more than on formal ones, missionaries did see their roles as supporters and fellow workers. Indeed, the relation of missionaries to national workers, said Wiese, should be one of friends, partners and comrades. As for other leaders, missionaries appointed Wong Pao-hsi vice-president of the school, and Dr. S. E. Liu, from Fujian Province, who had recently graduated from Peking Union Medical College, as head of the hospital. Most missionaries looked upon the increased leadership of the Chinese favorably, while a few, including Osborn, believed that such assignments were premature. As late as 1941 Osborn was hoping for 15 more years of Bible school graduates and was saying, "For us to go soon would be losing much that has been invested."<sup>73</sup>

This is where the church stood, then, when the war situation forced the missionaries to evacuate North China for virtually the last time. At the time there were 130 enrolled in the Bible school, with a fully Chinese faculty of eight; 134 workers, including the medical staff, Bible women, and 75 pastors; 54 organized churches; 2,120 full and 3,412 probationary members; and eight elementary schools enrolling 260 students. The Chinese church also was contributing well to the over-all expenses.<sup>74</sup>

---

<sup>72</sup>Katherine Wiese to Jones, November 28, 1946, World Mission office (reel 49).

<sup>73</sup>Osborn, "Self-Support in the Church of the Nazarene in China," *Other Sheep* (February 1941), 24. Similarly, Osborn, *Hitherto*, 48. Also see Reed and Wiese, *Challenge*, 128; [Lillian] Pattee, "Forty Dollars Paid Back," *Other Sheep* (October 1941), 14; Kiehn, "Our Native Workers," *Other Sheep* (April 1939), 25-26; Kiehn to Jones, November 12, 1940. Osborn, "News from the China Field," *Other Sheep* (November 1941), 14-15; Henry Wesche, "Bresee Memorial Hospital Notes," *Other Sheep* (January 1942), 16-18; Arthur Moses, "Bresee Memorial Hospital Report," *Other Sheep* (April 1942), 7; "Council Minutes," 1941.

<sup>74</sup>"Field Statistics, 1941"; "China District Church of the Nazarene Council Minutes," September 1941; "Latest News from China," *Other Sheep* (April 1942),



The Japanese incarcerated the Nazarene missionaries on the field at the time of Pearl Harbor, the L. C. Osborns, John Pattee, Arthur Moses, who had recently arrived to help administer the hospital, and Mary Scott, who also had but recently come to China. When the Japanese took over of the mission compound, they also jailed Hsu and Yu for 40 days. While the missionaries remained interred in the area for six months, they deeded the Bible school to the Chinese and handed over a complete record of all other property held by the church, including the hospital, which by this time the Japanese military had confiscated. The Japanese eventually repatriated all except Scott, who expressed her preference to stay in China rather than seek repatriation and remained imprisoned through the duration of the war.<sup>75</sup>

While interred, Osborn, then serving as Superintendent, authorized the Chinese church to ordain irregularly several Chinese pastors, including Yu Wan-ch'ien and Ma Hsueh-wen.<sup>76</sup> The Committee of Twenty-Four Chinese leaders met and planned the next Annual Meeting. As if to prove to the missionaries that the church would go on without them, by the time the interred missionaries left the country the Chinese had already built four new churches.<sup>77</sup>

The persecution of the church during the war with Japan only seemed to increase the number of preaching places, and churches

---

7; By comparison, the Jesuits had only one Chinese priest in the area of Daming in 1940, and 16 seminarians, but about 40,000 adherents. See Malatesta, "China and the Society of Jesus," 43.

<sup>75</sup>Pattee, *Hazardous Days*, 72-82; Mary L. Scott, *Kept in Safeguard* (KC: NPH, 1977), 30-47.

<sup>76</sup>Orval Nease, "Foreign Visitation: 1948," 9; conversations with Liu Wan-cheng, Lee Ling En and others, Handan and Daming, March 14-15, 1999.

<sup>77</sup>(Ed.), "Our Work in China," *Other Sheep* (April 1942), 11, quoting a letter from Osborn; Osborn to Swiss Consul General, June 25, 1942, which details the property holdings, assessed to be about \$600,000.00 (file 453-29); Wiese, "Chinese Facts," n.d., in the papers of Orval Nease (file 784-61).

assumed full support of their pastors. Hsu Kwei-pin continued the Bible school until 1942 or 1943, and significant workers were added to those who had graduated previously.

The situation “by one stroke made the Chinese church entirely independent and self-supporting.”<sup>78</sup> The achievement of self-support, self-government and self-propagation came not at the end of the slow processes of missions strategy and planning, but because of social and political realities. Only a few workers left the mission. At least two young leaders, Kao E-feng, whom the missionaries had tried unsuccessfully to send to Pasadena College, and Shang Chih-rung fled to north-western China.<sup>79</sup>

There were no further contacts with the field until the end of the war. When the Japanese evacuated at the close of the war the Communist army of Mao Zedong quickly moved in. Like other missionaries, the Nazarenes recalled the execution of China Inland Mission missionaries John and Mary Stam by Chinese Communists in 1934.<sup>80</sup> Nevertheless, Wiese and Pattee returned to Beijing in 1946 and had conversations with Yuan Hsuan-ch'un and others from the Daming area. Yuan had preached in Chengan during the war and had recently transferred to Beijing, where he along with Chao, who had graduated from the Bible school in 1942 or 1943, worked with a Norwegian missionary. Yuan and others advised Wiese and Pattee that it was best for them not to attempt a trip to the Daming area, but to send word to the field that they

---

<sup>78</sup>Pattee, “Effect of the War on the Churches of Chengan County,” *Other Sheep* (October 1942), 11-12.

<sup>79</sup>Osborn to Jones, May 30, 1940 and March 24, 1942; Osborn to General Superintendents and Department of Foreign Missions, July 3, 1940; Scott, Peking, to Jones, October 22, 1945; conversation with Shang Chih-rung, May 31, 1989; and conversations with Liu Wan-cheng and others, Handan and Daming, March 14-15, 1999.

<sup>80</sup>[Geraldine] Taylor, *The Triumph of John and Betty Stam* (Philadelphia: China Inland Mission, 1935), 100-125; Dorothy Borg, *The United States and the Far Eastern Crisis*, 596.

were in the country and to wait for some of the workers to come to Beijing. Wiese and Pattee also received a report from Yu Wan-ch'ien, who along with Hsu Kwei-pin had remained in Daming for the duration, that only about six pastors remained engaged in full-time ministry. Two pastors had been killed outright during the civil war. As Communists criticized pastors for taking money from the poor, some had begun businesses or taken second jobs to support themselves and their families. In turn, local congregations reduced support to them. Wiese lamented this.

Unwilling to wait in Beijing, Pattee secured permission to visit Handan with a United Nations worker distributing medicine there, and clandestinely traveled to Daming at the same time. He found the large church building on the compound completely destroyed and the other buildings taken over by the county government. The county magistrate himself was living in one of the missionary residences. Both Wiese and Pattee realized that though it was still theoretically possible for missionaries to work in the area, the Communist government would severely curtail their activities. They would not be able to visit other stations, the chief buildings of which were also now in government hands. It was hard for Christians in general. Authorities constantly questioned Christians and their worship activities. But Wiese and Pattee were heartened that laypersons were carrying on the faith.<sup>81</sup>

In succeeding years, in spite of periods of repression by the government, Christian workers advanced the church in the old field. As the result of migrations during the post-war years, no ordained Nazarene pastors remained on the field after 1947. Many buildings either had been destroyed or were being used for other purposes. If the church had been rigidly attached to these forms of churchly structure, there may

---

<sup>81</sup>Wiese, "Conditions on Our Field"; Wiese to Wesche, September 10, 1946; Wiese, "Report of Our China Field" (received July 1946); Wiese, "What the Bible School Meant to Our Work During the Recent Years of Stress," *Other Sheep* (July 1947), 7-8; Wiese, "The Peril of the Church in Our Old Field in China," n.d., World Mission office (reel 53); Sutherland, *China Crisis*, 106-107, 132-133; conversations with Yuan Hsuan-ch'un, Beijing, May 19, 1989.

have been less freedom to carry on in whatever ways were necessary and possible. The Gospel Mission and Mennonite work effectively merged with the Nazarene in the area to form a loose but practical structure. As it turned out, committed leaders, graduates or former students of the Bible school, emerged on the basis of both gifts and preparation for ministry. They placed at least one Bible school graduate in each of the counties in which the Nazarenes had work. These maintained the respect of the people apart from any ecclesiastical sanctions.

That meant that when the support and control of the world church was cut off, the church not only survived, it flourished. The Nazarene churches registered with the government in the 1950s, and became part of the Three Selves Patriotic Movement. Though the hospital and schools could not continue, pastors continued to preach the message of holiness as they had been taught it and to evangelize the unconverted.<sup>82</sup>

During the Cultural Revolution, which began in 1966, all churches were closed. Christians were persecuted. The church moved underground—into houses. After the Revolution, in 1982, the government issued “Document 19,” which promised religious toleration and allowed churches to reopen. Once again, those churches that had been Nazarene registered with the government, and the workers affiliated again with the Three Selves Patriot Movement. Within it, situations varied; but pastors in the old Nazarene field—though forbidden to address political issues—continued to itinerate, preach and teach. The former Nazarenes were able to maintain theological distinctives while participating in the Three Selves church. Several graduates of the Bible school, including Chang Chin, continued to work as evangelists and pastors through the 1990s, until they were well past 70 and 80 years old. Many pastored while farming. Almost all of the leaders of the large church in Handan had roots in the Nazarene mission. The church remained strong in Chengan. In several places Bible women continued the work. One maintained work at the site of the Houlding mission outside of Daming.

---

<sup>82</sup>Compare the similar account of Yunnan province Christians at this time in T'ien Ju-K'ang, *Peaks of Faith: Protestant Mission in Revolutionary China* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1993), 69-71, 129-132, and throughout.

In 1992 the government allowed the reopening of a church inside the city itself. About the same time, a Bible school led by former Nazarenes was opened in Handan. Eventually, as the Bible school graduates began to pass away, the children and grandchildren of these leaders continued and extended the ministry. They served as itinerant evangelists and Bible women, preaching and teaching holiness just as their fathers and mothers had done. A conservative estimate was that by that time there were 75,000 believers in the five Hebei Province counties in which the Church of the Nazarene had worked.<sup>83</sup>

Wiese and Pattee, certain, though mistakenly, that the Nationalist government would soon defeat the Communists and open up the old field again, turned their attention toward the possibility of the church entering a new area. They contacted the National Christian Council in Shanghai about which sections of the country might be open for work. Upon the suggestion of the Council, the Nazarenes chose a field in southern Jiangxi Province around the cities of Ji'an and Kanhsien. One strong factor in choosing this field was that Mandarin, the dialect the missionaries had learned in the North, was spoken in the area.

Nazarenes began work in 1947. Katherine Wiese and Lillian Pattee soon joined their husbands. Others who arrived were R. G. and Lura Fitz and Mary Scott, from the old field, and newly-appointed missionaries Michael and Elizabeth Varro (daughter of the Fitzes) and Ruth Brickman. Both Hsu Kwei-pin, whom the missionaries had feared was dead, and Yu Wan-ch'ien fled south from the Communists and found

---

<sup>83</sup>On the basis of the writer's trips to Daming, Chengan and Handan, May 29-June 1, 1989; and conversations with Liu Wan-cheng and others, Handan and Daming, March 14-15, 1999. See John Pattee to Rev. and Mrs. Chi Yuew-han, May 3, 1988; my report in the Nazarene archives; and Floyd T. Cunningham, "The Church is Not the Buildings but the People," *World Mission* (November 1989): 12-13. See also the May 1986 issue of the *World Mission* magazine. For Document 19 see Appendix I, in *Christianity in China: Foundations for Dialogue*, eds. Beatrice Leung and John D. Young (Hong Kong: University of Hong Kong, 1993), 286-309. See also Wickeri, *Seeking the Common Ground*, 185-195; Tony Lambert, *The Resurrection of the Chinese Church* (Wheaton, IL: OMF, 1994), 72-77, and throughout; Hunter and Chan, *Protestantism in Contemporary China*, 66-104.

the Nazarene work. Yu became pastor of the church in Kanhsien. Contacts with Christians in the city easily persuaded them to join the Nazarene church. Hsu aided the Bible school, which began in October 1948. The mission quickly erected buildings in Ji'an and established a compound. In comparison to the work in the North, in which most of the converts were poor farmers, the members in the southern field were from the business and professional classes. As the months wore on the missionaries sensed the political reality that the Communists would take over the entire country. Just as they had in north China before the war with Japan, the missionaries intensified their efforts to raise a self-supporting church and promoted indigenous leadership.<sup>84</sup>

The work quickly came to a close. When General Superintendent Orval Nease toured eastern Asia in 1948 and visited Jiangxi, he officially recognized the earlier, irregular ordinations of Yu and Ma Hsueh-wen, who also had fled south. In addition, Nease ordained Chi Yuew-han. Chi had been taken into the church by Peter Kiehn in 1938, and had worked with John Pattee in Chengan before the war. From 1940 to 1944 he studied at North China Theological Seminary. Following his graduation he returned to Shandong Province to preach. With the spread of the Red Army, in 1946 Chi fled south and made contact with the Nazarene missionaries in Jiangxi. Nease was impressed with both the Chinese leaders and the solid beginnings of the work, but he knew that evacuation of the missionaries was imminent. Even while he was there the American consul gave advice on this regard and several missionaries returned home. By 1949, after 21 months of work, all were forced out. At that time there were three organized churches and 70 members, plus 200 probationers. After the missionaries left, the Bible school continued under Hsu for at least one year. Though the mission-

---

<sup>84</sup>Nease, "Foreign Visitation," 8-12; Wiese to Jones, January 8, 1947 and March 27, 1947; Osborn, n.d. (file 1257-20); Sutherland, *China Crisis*, 108-112, 123-124.

aries held some optimism about returning, it was the Chinese who carried on the work.<sup>85</sup>

Wiese became involved in promoting the Chinese work in California, hoping that he was training workers for the day when China would again be open. The Missions department sent John and Lillian Pattee to the Philippines. The Kiehns and the Osborns turned to Taiwan, but did so independently. R. G. Fitz pioneered the Nazarene work in Alaska. John Sutherland found a position teaching history at Northwest Nazarene College. Scott became general secretary of the denomination's Women's Foreign Missionary Society in 1950.

### Conclusions

In retrospect, though Nazarene missionaries worked both closely and congenially with Chinese workers, the development of national leadership as a whole was slow. Missionaries held on to positions of leadership. In old China pastors had to petition for positions of responsibility in the field even after revivals and evangelistic fervor proved their spiritual worthiness and equality with the North American workers. Their advancement and the eventual indigenization of the entire work in mainland China was prompted by political and social necessities, not by deliberate action on the part of either the mission council or the general church. Though the church was by policy committed to the development of a district, organization lagged far behind the evangelistic aspect of the work in the mainland. Were it not for the self-propagating part of the work, it would not have survived. The Chinese, convinced of the necessity of self-direction, were inde-

---

<sup>85</sup>Nease, "Foreign Visitation"; Wiese, "Chinese Feasts"; Nease, "Chinese Feasts," *Other Sheep* 36 (July 1949); "Testimony of John Ch'i," trans. R.G. Fitz, *Other Sheep* (August 1949), 12; Wiese, "Southern California Convention," May 11, 1950 (file 2069-26); Russell V. DeLong and Mendell Taylor, *Fifty Years of Nazarene Missions*, vol. 2: *History of the Fields* (Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1955), 88-92; Osborn, *China*, 63-69; Osborn, *Christ at the Bamboo Curtain* (Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1956), 117-120. Hsu died in the mid-1970s. See John Pattee to Rev. and Mrs. Chi Yuewhan, May 3, 1988.

pendently heading toward this as well as toward self-support when political crises hastened the process. Part of the reason for the delay in both the advancement of Chinese leaders and the full organization of a district was related to the sporadic attention given to ministerial education. This was due in part to both the generally low level of education among the Chinese farmers with whom the Nazarenes worked in North China, and certain government pressures. Not until the last years of work there did the church give concerted attention to this, but through intensive effort it developed a highly motivated, second generation of workers that carried on the church long after the missionaries left.

As important as were the evangelistic and social ministries of the church, the future depended largely upon a capable leadership. Indeed by the 1980s “shouting” and other heresies developed in Shandong. Chinese leaders believed that their theological grounding had prevented more of these sorts of heterodox phenomena. But leaders still craved theological books and instruction through which a new generation of leaders might be indoctrinated in holiness.<sup>86</sup>

The evangelistic ministry of the church was tied somewhat to shifting political and economic realities, but the educational component, the passing on of tradition as well as practice, was necessary for the fullest development of the indigenous church. Without the Bible school graduates, both men and women, the work would have been much less. The enthusiasm for spreading the faith by lay members and lay pastors kept the church on the mainland strong and growing. Indeed, if there had been a more hierarchical structure in place there, the evangelistic movement may have been more constrained.

---

<sup>86</sup>Conversations with Shang Chih-rung, May 31, 1989 and Li Bae-Ch'in, June 1989.